

A Guide to Refugee Law in Australia

Legal Services

Refugee Review Tribunal

Disclaimer: This Guide was prepared by the Legal Services Section of the Refugee Review Tribunal and Migration Review Tribunal, for use by members and staff. It is provided for general information only. It is not intended as a legal textbook or a substitute for advice and should not be treated as such. No warranty is given in relation to the accuracy, currency or completeness of the Guide. The Commonwealth Government, its employees, officers or agents accept no responsibility for any loss or damage, whether direct or indirect, arising from use of, or reliance on, material contained in the Guide. The material in this Guide may include the views of third parties, but do not necessarily reflect the views of the Tribunal or of the Commonwealth Government.

© Commonwealth of Australia 2012

This work is copyright. You may download, display, print and reproduce this material in unaltered form only for your personal, non-commercial use or use within your organisation provided that an appropriate acknowledgement is made (retaining this notice). Apart from any use as permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, all other rights are reserved. Requests and enquiries concerning reproduction and rights should be addressed to: Copyright Officer, Migration Review Tribunal & Refugee Review Tribunal, PO Box 14158, Melbourne VIC 8001; or email: copyright@mrt-rrt.gov.au.

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER 1: PROTECTION VISAS

THE STATUTORY CONTEXT	1-1
THE PROTECTION VISA SCHEME.....	1-2
REQUIREMENTS FOR A VALID PROTECTION VISA APPLICATION.....	1-4
Previous refusal of protection visa	1-4
Comprehensive Plan of Action and safe third countries	1-5
Temporary safe haven visa	1-5
Protection of third countries.....	1-6
Offshore entry persons and transitory persons	1-7
The form of application.....	1-7
Consideration of a valid visa application	1-8
CRITERIA FOR GRANT OF A PROTECTION VISA	1-8
Section 36 criteria	1-8
Schedule 2 criteria.....	1-9
PERSONS TO WHOM AUSTRALIA HAS PROTECTION OBLIGATIONS	1-13
PROTECTION OBLIGATIONS UNDER THE REFUGEES CONVENTION.....	1-13
The Refugees Convention - Historical background and structure	1-14
The Convention definition of ‘refugee’	1-15
The statutory qualifications: Sections 36(3), 91R, 91S, 91T.....	1-15
PROTECTION OBLIGATIONS ON COMPLEMENTARY PROTECTION GROUNDS	1-16
The statutory qualifications: sections 36(2B), 36(2C) and 36(3)	1-17
INTERPRETATIVE PRINCIPLES	1-18
INTERPRETING INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS	1-19

CHAPTER 2: COUNTRY OF REFERENCE

INTRODUCTION.....	2-1
COUNTRY OF REFERENCE – THE REFUGEES CONVENTION.....	2-1
WHAT IS A ‘COUNTRY’?	2-3
COUNTRY OF NATIONALITY	2-3
What is nationality?	2-4
The factual assessment of nationality.....	2-6
Dual or multiple nationality	2-7

STATELESSNESS AND COUNTRY OF FORMER HABITUAL RESIDENCE.....	2-10
Identifying the country of former habitual residence	2-11
More than one country of former habitual residence?.....	2-13
Statelessness alone is not sufficient to attract refugee status	2-14
A past fear of persecution is not sufficient.....	2-15
Assessing a well-founded fear of persecution where no right of return	2-15
OTHER ISSUES	2-16
Where applicant is a national of a country and former resident of a second country	2-16
Where family members are of different nationalities	2-16
Children born in Australia	2-17

CHAPTER 3: WELL FOUNDED FEAR

INTRODUCTION.....	3-1
THE ELEMENTS OF ‘WELL-FOUNDED FEAR’	3-2
THE SUBJECTIVE ELEMENT	3-2
THE OBJECTIVE ELEMENT	3-3
The ‘real chance’ test.....	3-3
The relevant time for determination.....	3-5
Assessment of a real chance of persecution	3-5
The role of past events in establishing a ‘well-founded fear’	3-6
Consideration of general information about country conditions	3-10
WELL-FOUNDED FEAR AND STATE PROTECTION	3-11
REFUGEES ‘SUR PLACE’	3-11
BECOMING A REFUGEE <i>SUR PLACE</i> THROUGH VOLUNTARY ACTIONS	3-12
WHAT IS THE EFFECT OF ACTIONS TAKEN IN BAD FAITH? – SECTION 91R(3).....	3-12
What is conduct?	3-14
Whose conduct is relevant?.....	3-15
Purpose of the conduct.....	3-16
When must the conduct be disregarded?.....	3-17
CONCLUSIONS.....	3-17

CHAPTER 4: PERSECUTION

INTRODUCTION.....	4-1
SERIOUS HARM	4-3
THE RELEVANCE OF AN APPLICANT’S PERSONAL ATTRIBUTES.....	4-7
SYSTEMATIC AND DISCRIMINATORY CONDUCT	4-7
‘SYSTEMATIC...’	4-8
‘...AND DISCRIMINATORY’	4-10

OTHER ISSUES	4-11
AGENTS OF PERSECUTION	4-11
LAWS AND LAW ENFORCEMENT	4-13
Discriminatory failure of state protection as persecution	4-13
PERSECUTION ON CUMULATIVE GROUNDS	4-16

CHAPTER 5: CONVENTION GROUNDS AND NEXUS

INTRODUCTION.....	5-1
‘FOR REASONS OF...’	5-2
CAUSAL CONNECTION BETWEEN THE HARM FEARED AND A CONVENTION GROUND	5-2
THE MOTIVATIONAL REQUIREMENT	5-4
IMPUTED ATTRIBUTE SUFFICIENT TO ESTABLISH NEXUS	5-5
MOTIVATION OF THE APPLICANT INSUFFICIENT	5-5
FOCUS ON THE PERSECUTOR’S MOTIVATION	5-7
CONVENTION GROUND MUST BE THE ESSENTIAL AND SIGNIFICANT REASON OR REASONS.....	5-8
THE CONVENTION GROUNDS	5-10
RACE	5-11
RELIGION.....	5-12
Definition of ‘religion’	5-12
Persecution ‘for reasons of’ religion	5-14
NATIONALITY.....	5-16
MEMBERSHIP OF A PARTICULAR SOCIAL GROUP.....	5-17
Overview.....	5-18
Characteristics of a particular social group	5-19
What is not required.....	5-25
The ‘is/does’ distinction.....	5-26
Identifying particular social groups.....	5-28
Examples of particular social groups	5-28
Membership of a family – Section 91S	5-34
‘For reasons of...membership’	5-36
POLITICAL OPINION	5-38
‘For reasons of...political opinion’	5-41
FACT-FINDING – TESTING AN APPLICANT’S KNOWLEDGE	5-43

CHAPTER 6: RELOCATION

INTRODUCTION.....	6-1
THE RELOCATION PRINCIPLE	6-1
TEXTUAL FOUNDATION	6-2
APPLYING THE RELOCATION TEST	6-3

WHETHER THE FEARED PERSECUTION IS LOCALISED.....	6-3
‘Discretion’	6-5
WHETHER RELOCATION IS REASONABLE IN ALL THE CIRCUMSTANCES.....	6-7
Should or would reasonably relocate?.....	6-7
Country conditions	6-9
The applicant’s particular circumstances	6-12
SPECIFICALLY IDENTIFYING AN AREA TO WHICH THE APPLICANT CAN RELOCATE	6-13
CONSIDERATION OF RELOCATION AS A PRELIMINARY ISSUE	6-13

CHAPTER 7: EXCLUSION AND CESSATION

INTRODUCTION.....	7-2
EXCLUSION AND CESSATION IN RELATION TO REFUGEE STATUS	7-2
EXCLUSION FROM COMPLEMENTARY PROTECTION	7-3
JURISDICTIONAL AND PROCEDURAL ISSUES	7-3
ARTICLE 1C	7-5
OVERVIEW	7-5
CIRCUMSTANCES IN WHICH ARTICLE 1C ISSUES MAY ARISE FOR CONSIDERATION	7-7
CHANGES IN PERSONAL CIRCUMSTANCES – ARTICLE 1C(1) - (4)	7-8
CHANGES IN COUNTRY CIRCUMSTANCES - ARTICLE 1C(5) AND (6)	7-11
ARTICLE 1D.....	7-15
GENERAL.....	7-15
HISTORICAL BACKGROUND TO ARTICLE 1D.....	7-15
EXCLUSION UNDER ARTICLE 1D.....	7-17
ARTICLE 1E	7-25
GENERAL.....	7-25
THE APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 1E	7-25
‘TAKEN RESIDENCE’	7-25
RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS OF A NATIONAL	7-26
ARTICLE 1F.....	7-29
INTRODUCTION.....	7-29
SERIOUS REASONS FOR CONSIDERING.....	7-30
CRIMES AGAINST PEACE, WAR CRIMES, CRIMES AGAINST HUMANITY.....	7-32
SERIOUS NON-POLITICAL CRIMES	7-39
ACTS CONTRARY TO THE PURPOSES AND PRINCIPLES OF THE UN.....	7-48
STATUTORY EXCLUSION – SECTION 36(3) - (5A)	7-51
ARTICLES 32 AND 33(2)	7-53
ARTICLE 32	7-53
ARTICLE 33	7-54

CHAPTER 8: STATE PROTECTION

INTRODUCTION.....	8-1
‘THE PROTECTION OF THAT COUNTRY’ = EXTERNAL PROTECTION.....	8-2
UNABLE OR UNWILLING	8-3
INTERNAL PROTECTION	8-4
WELL-FOUNDED FEAR	8-5
PERSECUTION.....	8-6
UNABLE OR UNWILLING	8-7
ADEQUACY OF PROTECTION	8-8
WHETHER CIRCUMSTANCES ESTABLISH LACK OF PROTECTION.....	8-12
NO LEGAL PRESUMPTION OF STATE PROTECTION	8-13
PROTECTION FROM NON-GOVERNMENT AGENCIES	8-14
PROTECTION AND STATELESSNESS.....	8-15
NO FUNCTIONING STATE APPARATUS – ‘PROTECTION’ VS ‘ACCOUNTABILITY’	8-15

CHAPTER 9: THIRD COUNTRY PROTECTION

INTRODUCTION.....	9-1
THE ‘EFFECTIVE PROTECTION’ DOCTRINE (<i>THIYAGARAJAH</i>)	9-3
REJECTION OF THE ‘EFFECTIVE PROTECTION’ DOCTRINE	9-4
THE STATUTORY QUALIFICATION TO ‘PROTECTION OBLIGATIONS’	9-4
RIGHT TO ENTER AND RESIDE, WHETHER TEMPORARILY OR PERMANENTLY	9-6
Right to enter and reside	9-7
Whether temporarily or permanently	9-8
‘Right’ means a legally enforceable right.....	9-9
‘Right’ means a presently existing right.....	9-10
‘However that right arose or is expressed’	9-12
ALL POSSIBLE STEPS	9-12
APPLYING SECTION 36(3) – SOME SCENARIOS	9-13
THE QUALIFICATIONS TO SECTION 36(3).....	9-15
Sections 36(4)(a) and (5) – well-founded fear of being persecuted.....	9-15
Sections 36(4)(b) and (5A) – real risk of significant harm.....	9-16

CHAPTER 10: COMPLEMENTARY PROTECTION

INTRODUCTION.....	10-2
RECEIVING COUNTRY	10-3
PERSONS WITH A NATIONALITY	10-4
STATELESS PERSONS	10-4

ASSESSMENT OF RISK	10-5
SUBSTANTIAL GROUNDS FOR BELIEVING ... THERE IS A REAL RISK	10-5
The international perspective	10-6
A NECESSARY AND FORESEEABLE CONSEQUENCE.....	10-9
SUR PLACE CLAIMS	10-10
SIGNIFICANT HARM.....	10-10
ARBITRARY DEPRIVATION OF LIFE.....	10-11
THE DEATH PENALTY WILL BE CARRIED OUT.....	10-12
TORTURE.....	10-13
‘Torture’ - the Migration Act and international jurisprudence	10-14
Severe pain or suffering, whether physical or mental	10-15
Intentionally inflicted	10-15
Purpose	10-16
Lawful sanctions	10-18
CRUEL OR INHUMAN TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT.....	10-19
The international perspective	10-20
(Severe) pain or suffering.....	10-20
An act or omission which ... could reasonably be regarded as cruel or inhuman in nature ...	10-21
Intention.....	10-22
Act or omission not inconsistent with Article 7	10-22
Lawful sanctions	10-22
DEGRADING TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT	10-22
Extreme humiliation which is unreasonable.....	10-23
Intention.....	10-23
Act or omission not inconsistent with Article 7	10-24
Lawful sanctions	10-24
CIRCUMSTANCES IN WHICH THERE IS TAKEN NOT TO BE A REAL RISK	10-24
RELOCATION	10-25
PROTECTION FROM AN AUTHORITY	10-26
A RISK FACED BY THE POPULATION GENERALLY.....	10-27
PROTECTION OF A THIRD COUNTRY	10-28
INEGLIGIBILITY FOR GRANT OF A PROTECTION VISA	10-29
CRIMES AGAINST PEACE, WAR CRIMES, CRIMES AGAINST HUMANITY, SERIOUS NON-POLITICAL CRIMES AND ACTS CONTRARY TO THE PURPOSES AND PRINCIPLES OF THE UN	10-29
DANGER TO THE AUSTRALIAN COMMUNITY.....	10-31
LIMITATIONS OF THE TRIBUNAL’S JURISDICTION	10-31

CHAPTER 11: APPLICATION OF THE LEGAL PRINCIPLES IN PARTICULAR SITUATIONS

INTRODUCTION.....	11-1
-------------------	------

FAILURE TO ADHERE TO BASIC STANDARDS OF HUMAN RIGHTS	11-2
CIVIL DISTURBANCES	11-3
LAWS AND LAW ENFORCEMENT	11-4
LAWS OF GENERAL APPLICATION.....	11-4
Selective enforcement of a law of general application	11-8
General laws that impact adversely on a particular group	11-9
The legitimacy threshold.....	11-10
Discriminatory laws that are not enforced.....	11-13
DETENTION AND MISTREATMENT IN DETENTION	11-13
CONSCRIPTION LAWS	11-15
‘VALUE-LADEN’ LAWS	11-23
POSITIVE DISCRIMINATION	11-24
DENIAL OF THE RIGHT TO RETURN / EXPULSION	11-25
SELF EXPRESSION AND SUPPRESSION OF OPINIONS, BELIEFS AND IDENTITY	11-26
CLAIMS ARISING FROM PERSONAL AND FAMILY RELATIONSHIPS	11-29
FAMILIAL REJECTION AND FAMILIAL PRESSURE TO MARRY	11-30
VIOLENCE ARISING FROM PERSONAL RELATIONSHIPS	11-31
CRIMINAL CONDUCT.....	11-33
REVENGE.....	11-33
EXTORTION	11-35
HARM RESULTING FROM EXPOSING CORRUPTION	11-36
VULNERABILITY.....	11-38